

PART A:

Journal Name:	International Journal of TROPICAL DISEASE & Health
Manuscript Number:	MS: 2012/IJTDH/1308
Title of the Manuscript:	<i>A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF CONTRACEPTION AS PROXIMATE DETERMINANT OF FERTILITY AMONG WOMEN IN RURAL AND URBAN AREAS OF OSUN STATE SOUTHWESTERN NIGERIA</i>
Manuscript received on (Date)	
Review comment submitted (Date)	

PART B: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part and write here 'Corrected'/ if not agreed, give suitable justifications)
General comment:	See below	
Specific comments:	See below	
Title and abstract	The title is long and not clearly understood. A better title might be: "A comparative study of the role of contraception in fertility rates among women in rural and urban areas in Nigeria" or "Contraceptive practices among rural and urban women in Osun State, South-western Nigeria." Lines 15-16: Doesn't read easily as stated: Four hundred and thirteen (83.4%) and 475 (95.4%) of rural and urban respondents were aware of contraceptives with only 86(18.6%) and 239(48.5%) using a method respectively. It would be more clear to state: "Four hundred thirteen rural respondents and 475 urban respondents were aware of contraceptives with only 86 (18.6 %) and 239 (48.5 %) respectively using a contraceptive method." Lines 23-26: Again, lack of clarity when stated "Women with formal education had about a half (OR=0.59, C.I=0.45-0.95 and p=0.001) fold fertility compared to women with no formal education. Similarly women who used contraceptives have about one-eight (OR=0.08, C.I=0.06-0.12 and p=0.019) fold chance of a fertility compared to women not using contraceptives." It would be more clear to state, "Women with formal education had about one-half the fertility rate compared to women with no formal education (OR = 0.59, CI = 0.45 – 0.95, p = 0.001). Similarly, women who used contraceptives had about one-eighth	Modification to Title: Contraceptive practices among rural and urban women in Osun State, South-western Nigeria Lines 15-16: suggestion accepted Lines 23-26: suggestion also accepted One eighth' changed to 'one twelfth' as argued out by one of the reviewers, and I agreed with him. Lines 27-28 Thanks, Conclusion modifies as appropriate (to emanate from study findings as recommended). This has been highlighted in yellow

	fertility rate compared to women not using contraceptives (OR = 0.08, CI = 0.06 – 0.12 and p = 0.001).” Line 27-28 Lines 27-28: I am not sure that this is the best conclusion, as stated, “Contraceptive services should be made more accessible to all women of child bearing age, most especially those living in rural communities” because the article does not address that much the availability of contraceptive services, and it does indicate a high level of awareness of types of contraceptives in both groups.	
--	---	--

Introduction	OK	
Review of literature (Heading may differ in the case of review paper)	OK	
Materials & methods (Heading may differ in the case of review paper)	OK	
Results & discussion (Heading may differ in the case of review paper)	Lines 135 – 179 present very important information. What I see there is that the people are aware of types of contraception possible, but there is very little, if anything, stated about the accessibility of these services. Only a very small % cite “too expensive” as a reason for non-use. Therefore, the previous paragraph is even more emphasized, because the conclusion that I would draw is that fear of use and other attitudes are more important than accessibility in the use of contraceptive services. I think it would be more helpful to insert the p value column in Tables I, II, and III, as a greater help in identifying significant differences. This might even make it unnecessary to add Table IV.	Noted. Table IV still retained as comments of the other two reviewers does not support removing it. However, little modifications has been made to clarify your observations in results and discussions - highlighted in yellow colours.
Conclusion	I am not sure that this is the best conclusion, as stated, “Contraceptive services should be made more accessible to all women of child bearing age, most especially those living in rural communities” because the article does not address that much the availability of contraceptive services, and it does indicate a high level of awareness of types of contraceptives in both groups.	Agreed, Conclusion now modified as appropriate (to emanate from study findings as recommended). This has been highlighted in yellow under conclusion
References	OK	